

**CALENDAR ITEM
C88**

A	Statewide	06/28/16
		W 26934
S	Statewide	W. Crunk

**CONSIDER PROPOSED ADDITION OF ARTICLE 14 TO TITLE 2, DIVISION 3,
CHAPTER 1 OF THE CALIFORNIA CODE OF REGULATIONS RELATING TO
ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS AND PENALTIES FOR UNAUTHORIZED
STRUCTURES ON STATE LAND**

PROPOSAL:

Commission staff proposes to add Article 14 to Chapter 1 of Division 3 of Title 2 of the California Code of Regulations. The new Article will add sections: 3000, 3001, 3002, 3003, 3004, 3005, 3006, 3007, 3008, 3009, 3010, 3011, 3012, 3013, 3014, 3015, and 3016. Collectively, this rulemaking specifies the procedures for administrative hearings and administrative penalties for unauthorized structures on State Lands authorized under Public Resources Code sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5.

BACKGROUND:

The Commission manages approximately 4.5 million acres of public land throughout the state, including navigable waterways, tidelands, submerged lands, and lands granted to the state by the U.S. Government to support public education (collectively "State Lands"). Unauthorized structures on State Lands create liability for the state. Unauthorized structures may be constructed unsafely, may not be properly maintained, and may be abandoned in place at the end of their economic life. Unauthorized structures may also impair public access and navigation, may impair authorized lessees' use of State Lands, and may cause environmental harm. By bringing structures under lease, the Commission identifies the structures' owner, obtains insurance coverage, indemnity from the lessee, and compensation for use of State Lands.

Before Public Resources Code sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5 became law, the Commission addressed unauthorized structures by filing a trespass and ejectment action in State Superior Court. These civil litigations are expensive and burdensome because the state almost certainly will not recover more than it spends litigating the case. Neither the Commission nor the Attorney General's Office has the resources to address the hundreds of unauthorized structures throughout the state through civil litigation alone. The proposed rulemaking implements a more efficient and less burdensome alternative to civil litigation.

CALENDAR ITEM NO. **C88** (CONT'D)

RULEMAKING PROCESS:

The proposed rulemaking was published on February 24, 2015, in accordance with the requirements of the Office of Administrative Law. Commission staff hosted a public comment hearing on June 8, 2015, at the Commission's Sacramento Office. The initial 46-day comment period closed on June 9, 2015. Commission staff revised the proposed regulations in response to public comment. The first revised text was available for public comment from September 4, 2015, through October 19, 2015.

The Commission adopted the regulations at its December 18, 2015 public meeting. Commission staff submitted the regulations to the Office of Administrative Law (OAL) on January 21, 2016. Commission staff subsequently withdrew the regulations to make additional improvements to the clarity and consistency of the regulations at the recommendation of OAL. The second revised text was available for public comment from April 1, 2016, through April 16, 2016. Staff now recommends the Commission adopt the final form of these regulations.

SUMMARY OF THE PROPOSED REGULATIONS:

The proposed regulations interpret, make specific, and clarify Public Resources Code sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, as well as harmonize these sections with existing law. A complete copy of the regulations as currently proposed are included as **Exhibit A** to this calendar item.

The proposed regulations identify two separate groups of Commission staff. The Enforcement Staff serves prosecutorial roles in the administrative process, including investigation, citation, and advocacy functions. The Advisory Staff serves quasi-judicial functions and provides legal and technical assistance to the Commissioners. The Commissioners or their alternates will serve as hearing officers in the hearings held at regularly noticed Commission meetings. The person alleged to have an unauthorized structure on State Land is known as the Respondent.

The Enforcement Staff may post a Notice of Violation on a structure suspected of violating Public Resources Code section 6224.3. The Notice will include a basic explanation of the suspected violation, will describe the evidence cited and how the Respondent may obtain copies, will include a copy of the governing regulations, and will include the Statement of Defense form. The Notice may be served by personal service or posted on the structures in question and mailed to the Respondent. The Respondent has 21 days from the date service is complete to respond to Enforcement Staff if the Respondent disputes the allegations. If the Respondent does not contact Commission staff within the given time, the

CALENDAR ITEM NO. **C88** (CONT'D)

Notice of Violation specifies the enforcement hearing date. If the Respondent fails to appear at the hearing, the Commission may issue an order by default.

If a Respondent disputes the allegations, the original hearing date is vacated. Enforcement Staff will prepare a Statement of Position, which is a more extensive and detailed legal and factual analysis than that provided with the Notice of Violation. Once the Enforcement Staff mails its Statement of Position, the Respondent has 45 days to complete the Statement of Defense form. Once each side submits their position papers, no further evidence or argument is allowed absent a showing of good cause and lack of prejudice to the other side. The Enforcement Staff has an exception to this evidentiary cutoff for evidence or argument submitted with the Enforcement Staff's response to the Respondent's Statement of Defense, provided such evidence or argument responds to evidence or arguments raised in the Statement of Defense. The purpose for this evidentiary cutoff is to avoid trial by surprise for either side and to reduce the length and complexity of the hearings.

The Advisory Staff reviews all submitted evidence and prepares a recommended decision and order for the Commission's consideration. The Advisory Staff will provide the recommended decision and order to the Commission, the Respondent, and the Enforcement Staff at least 30 days prior to the hearing. The recommended decision and order will specify the hearing date and general area of the hearing although the specific address may not be set until 10 days prior to the hearing.

The administrative hearings occur at a regularly scheduled, properly noticed, public Commission meeting. The acting chairperson will serve as the presiding officer. The hearings will include a short summary of each side's position with a focus on issues in controversy. The Commissioners may ask questions of either side. At the close of the hearing, the Commission may adopt the proposed decision, modify the proposed decision, or direct Advisory Staff to prepare a new decision on terms dictated by the Commission.

If the Commission determines a penalty is appropriate, the proposed regulations specify a base penalty of \$500 per day for the first 120 days, and \$1,000 per day starting the 121st day. This base penalty may be adjusted by the factors in Public Resources Code section 6224.3, subdivision (c). The penalty will terminate when the violation is remedied. The Commission may also set the penalty to a reduced amount for a set period of time to allow the Respondent to submit a lease application or obtain permits for removal of the violating structure.

The proposed regulations also include definitions necessary for clarity. The regulations provide a mechanism to change hearing dates or locations, or to

CALENDAR ITEM NO. **C88** (CONT'D)

continue hearings to a subsequent meeting. Although *ex parte*¹ communications are prohibited by other laws, the regulations identify the prohibition and provide the mechanism to remedy any conflicts created. The regulations provide standards of conduct for the hearings, set the standard for admissibility of evidence, specify the content of the enforcement record, and allow the Commission to designate certain decisions as precedent.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

The public comments received during the initial comment period and first revision were addressed in Calendar Item 122 from the December 18, 2015 Commission meeting. Staff received two comment letters during the comment period on the second revised text. One letter suggested that the newly revised text made it easier to initiate an action and more difficult to stop an action once it was initiated. In addition, the commenter was concerned that the administrative process would be used against potentially innocent persons and would erode the public's trust in the Commission.

The second comment letter objected to the regulations because property rights should not be determined in an administrative hearing. The commenter also stated that it is unlikely the Commission can provide appropriate due process without incurring substantial economic impact to the agency. Finally, the letter objects to the 15-day comment period as being too short.

Commission staff did not modify the proposed regulations in response to these comments. The evidentiary burden Commission staff must meet is already set by existing law. The proposed regulations interpret and make specific the hearings authorized by Public Resources Code sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5. All comments, and the responses thereto, will be set forth in the Commission's Final Statement of Reasons. The Final Statement of Reasons will be submitted to the Office of Administrative Law along with the final regulatory package.

STAFF ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATION:

Statutory Authority:

The proposed regulatory rulemaking is authorized by Public Resources Code sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5.

¹ Ex parte communications are any direct or indirect communication with a person serving in a judicial role without notice to the opposing side and opportunity for the other side to participate in the communication. In this case, it means communications with the Commissioners, their alternates, or the Advisory Staff from either the Enforcement Staff or the Respondent.

CALENDAR ITEM NO. **C88** (CONT'D)

Public Trust and State's Best Interests Analysis:

The Commission's adoption of these regulations is an administrative action that will not have an immediate or direct impact on public trust resources.

Adoption of the regulations is in the best interests of the State because doing so will allow the Commission to more efficiently manage the State's public lands and resources and protect the State from liability.

OTHER PERTINENT INFORMATION:

1. The proposed regulations interpret, implement, and make specific the provisions of Public Resources Code sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5. These statutes reiterate existing common law and statutory prohibitions against unauthorized structures on State Land, and provide the Commission an administrative forum to impose fines on persons who refuse to remedy the violation.
2. The proposed regulations create a procedural framework for these administrative hearings within existing law. As such, the proposed regulations do not create new or significant impacts or obligations.
3. This action is consistent with Strategy 1.1.2 of the Commission's Strategic Plan to review existing safety standards and regulations for continued relevance and use the public rulemaking process to amend or adopt new regulations to enforce lease compliance and promote environmental protection and public health and safety, while reducing unnecessary bureaucracy; and Strategy 1.1.6 to enhance the Commission's Lease Compliance Enforcement Program to ensure efficiency and efficacy.
4. The staff recommends that the Commission find that adopting the proposed regulations does not have a potential for resulting in either a direct or a reasonably foreseeable indirect physical change in the environment, and is, therefore, not a project in accordance with the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA).

Authority: Public Resources Code section 21065 and California Code of Regulations, Title 14, sections 15060, subdivision (c)(3) and 15378.

EXHIBIT:

- A. Modified text of the proposed regulations, including the Notice of Violation and Statement of Defense forms.

CALENDAR ITEM NO. **C88** (CONT'D)

RECOMMENDED ACTION:

It is recommended that the Commission:

CEQA FINDING:

Find that adopting the proposed regulations is not subject to the requirements of CEQA pursuant to California Code of Regulations, Title 14, section 15060, subdivision (c)(3), because the subject activity is not a project as defined by Public Resources Code section 21065 and California Code of Regulations, Title 14, section 15378.

PUBLIC TRUST AND STATE'S BEST INTERESTS:

Find that adopting the proposed regulations is an administrative action in the best interests of the State.

AUTHORIZATION:

1. Adopt the proposed Article 14 of Chapter 1 of Division 3 of Title 2 of the California Code of Regulations, including sections: 3000, 3001, 3002, 3003, 3004, 3005, 3006, 3007, 3008, 3009, 3010, 3011, 3012, 3013, 3014, 3015, and 3016.
2. Find that the proposed rulemaking will not affect small businesses as defined in Government Code section 11342.610.
3. Find that the proposed rulemaking will not have a significant impact on the creation or elimination of jobs or new or existing businesses within California, nor will it have an adverse economic impact on business, including the ability of California businesses to compete with businesses in other states.
4. Find that no alternatives would be more effective in carrying out the purposes for which the rulemaking is proposed or would be as effective as and less burdensome to the affected private persons than the proposed regulations.
5. Authorize the Commission staff to make modifications to the proposed regulations in response to recommendations by the Office of Administrative Law.
6. Direct the Commission staff to take whatever action is necessary and appropriate to comply with provisions of the Government Code regarding adoption of regulations and to ensure that the regulations become effective.

CALENDAR ITEM NO. **C88** (CONT'D)

7. Direct Commission staff to take whatever action is necessary and appropriate to implement the proposed regulations when they become effective.

Proposed Text of Regulations

Title 2, California Code of Regulations, Division 3, Chapter 1

[Explanation: The proposed rulemaking would add all of the following language to the California Code of Regulations.]

Article 14: Administrative Hearings

§3000. Authority and Purpose

These regulations are promulgated pursuant to Section 6224.5(d) of the Public Resources Code to provide the Commission with procedures for orderly hearings and just administration of penalties under Sections 6224.3 and following for unauthorized Structures on State Lands. The procedures established by these regulations shall not apply to the Commission's Abandoned Vessels program authorized by Public Resources Code Sections 6302.1 and following.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5, Public Resources Code. Reference: Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, 6224.5, and 6302.1 et seq., Public Resources Code.

§ 3001. Definitions

- (a) As used in these regulations, words in the singular shall include the plural and words in the plural shall include the singular, unless the context otherwise requires. The following words, terms and phrases, when used in this Article, shall have the following meanings, unless the context clearly indicates otherwise:
- (1) "Advisory Staff" means the Commission's Executive Officer and his or her designees. The Advisory Staff provides legal and technical advice to the Commission related to an enforcement matter under this Article.
 - (2) "Commission" means the California State Lands Commission.
 - (3) "Commissioner" means a California State Lands Commissioner specified in Section 6101 of the Public Resources Code, or a designated alternate under Section 7.6 of the Government Code.
 - (4) "Commission Authorization" means a currently valid and unexpired, written and executed authorization to occupy State Lands, issued by the Commission.
 - (5) "Commission Meeting" means a regularly-noticed public meeting of the Commission.
 - (6) "Day" means calendar day. If a deadline falls on a weekend or state holiday, then the deadline will be deemed to be the next business day.
 - (7) "Enforcement Staff" means the Chief or Assistant Chief of the Commission's Land Management Division and his or her designees. The Enforcement Staff is responsible for

issuing the Notice of Violation and representing Commission staff before the Commission.

- (8) "Mail" means to send documents via the United States Postal Service, or reputable private carrier. The Respondent and Enforcement Staff may, and are encouraged to agree to service by electronic means including electronic mail or facsimile. Where such an agreement exists, "Mail" will include the agreed to method of electronic transmission. As between the Enforcement Staff, Advisory Staff, and/or the Commission, "Mail" includes any means reasonably calculated to ensure the documents arrive at their destination including hand delivery or courier.
- (9) "Notice of Violation" means the Notice of Violation (Rev. 03/2016) hereby incorporated by reference.
- (10) "Presiding Officer" means the Commissioner designated to conduct the hearings under this Article.
- (11) "Respondent" shall mean a person or entity suspected of violating Section 6224.3 of the Public Resources Code.
- (12) "State Lands" means land under Commission jurisdiction, held in fee by the state of California. "State Lands" excludes those lands legislatively granted in trust to local jurisdictions, and lands where the underlying fee is not held by the state, but a public trust easement exists.
- (13) "Structure" means any human construction, including but not limited to: buildings, boat houses, docks, piers, buoys, revetments, fill, pilings, pipelines, groins, jetties, seawalls, breakwaters, bulkheads; along with all similar constructions.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5, Public Resources Code. Reference: Section 7.6, Government Code; Sections 6101, 6102, 6216, 6224.3, 6224.4, 6224.5, 6301, and 8705, Public Resources Code.

§ 3002. Prohibited Conduct

- (a) Unless otherwise exempted, all Structures on State Lands require Commission Authorization. If the Commission Authorization prohibits transfer or assignment, subsequent owners or assignees must be approved by the Commission, or its designee.
- (b) Structures constructed, placed, maintained, owned, used, or possessed without Commission Authorization; Structures for which Commission Authorization has expired or been terminated; or Structures which vary from or exceed Commission Authorization are prohibited and shall constitute grounds for imposition of penalties and/or an injunction by the Commission.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224(d), Public Resources Code. Reference: Sections 6216.1, 6224.3, 6224.4, 6224.5, 6301, and 6303.1 Public Resources Code.

§ 3003. Investigation and Discovery

- (a) Commission staff may investigate a suspected violation of Section 6224.3 of the Public Resources Code.
- (b) Commission staff may survey the land and/or Structures in question pursuant to Civil Code section 846.5.
- (c) The Enforcement Staff may issue a Notice of Violation for a suspected violation of Section 6224.3 of the Public Resources Code.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5, Public Resources Code. Reference: Section 11180, Government Code; Section 8774, Business and Professions Code; Section 846.5, Civil Code; Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code.

§ 3004. Notice of Violation Procedure; Uncontested Violations

- (a) The Notice of Violation shall describe the alleged violation and shall reference the documents on which Commission staff relies to provide a prima facie case. The Respondent may request any or all documents relied on by staff, which shall be provided within five (5) business days of the request and upon payment of the copying costs. The Respondent may request the documents to be sent by Mail, or may appear at the Commission's Sacramento office to inspect and copy the relevant records. The Commission may also make records available electronically or on its website.
- (b) The Notice of Violation shall specify that the Respondent must reply within 21 Days of the date service of the Notice of Violation is deemed complete if they dispute the matters set forth in the Notice of Violation. The Notice of Violation shall include notice of the date, time, and location of the enforcement hearing where the matter will be heard if the Respondent fails to reply or does not dispute the allegations. The date of this hearing shall be not less than forty-five (45) Days from the date service is complete. If logistical circumstances prevent specifying the precise starting time and/or address of the Commission Meeting, the Notice of Violation may state the date and city or general location provided the Respondent is provided notice at least ten (10) Days prior to the hearing of the precise location and start time.
- (c) The Notice of Violation shall be accompanied by the Statement of Defense form (Rev. 03/2016) hereby incorporated by reference.
- (d) Personal service on Respondents other than natural persons may be completed in any manner that would satisfy the requirements of sections 416.10 et seq. of the Code of Civil Procedure. Personal service is deemed complete at the time of delivery.
- (e) If Enforcement Staff elect not to use personal service for the Notice of Violation, service may be completed by posting the Notice of Violation on the violating Structure and sending a

copy of the Notice of Violation to the Respondent by Mail service that includes delivery verification. The usual mailing address, normal place of business, or the address on record where the Respondent's property tax bill is sent shall be presumed to be the correct address. Any competent member of the household may sign the delivery verification. Service by Mail is deemed complete 10 Days after mailing.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5, Public Resources Code. Reference: Sections 416.10 et seq, Code of Civil Procedure; Section 11440.20, Government Code; Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code.

§ 3005. Stipulation of Fact; Resolution of Matter Without Hearing

- (a) Respondents are encouraged to contact the Enforcement Staff to determine whether a potential violation can be resolved without an enforcement hearing.
- (b) The Commission may resolve a matter with a stipulation, agreed settlement, or consent order, with the agreement of the Respondent, in lieu of holding a hearing. Such a resolution must be in writing or made by oral statement on the record.
- (c) The Advisory Staff may dismiss an individual Respondent or terminate an entire pending enforcement matter prior to the enforcement hearing upon discovering clear evidence that the Respondent is not liable for a violation of Public Resources Code section 6224.3.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5, Public Resources Code. Reference: Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code; Section 11415.60, Government Code.

§ 3006. Public Notification; Change of Date or Venue

- (a) The Commission Meeting agenda shall include notice of the enforcement hearing.
- (b) If the date, time, or location of the Commission Meeting during which the enforcement matter will be heard changes, Commission staff shall Mail notice of the new date, time, and place of the enforcement hearing to all Respondents at their last known address at least thirty (30) days prior to the new meeting date. If logistical circumstances prevent specifying the precise starting time and/or address of the Commission Meeting, the notice may state the date and city or general location provided the Respondent is notified at least ten (10) Days prior to the hearing of the precise location and start time.
- (c) If a subsequent enforcement hearing is necessary, notice of the subsequent hearing may be given by either announcing the date, time, and place of the subsequent hearing on the record at the close of the enforcement hearing, or by Mail to all Respondents at least thirty (30) Days prior to the further enforcement hearing. If logistical circumstances prevent specifying the precise starting time and/or address of the Commission Meeting, the notice may state the date and city or general location provided the Respondent is notified at least ten (10) Days prior to the hearing of the precise location and start time. Notice of a subsequent hearing will also be provided in the Commission Meeting agenda.

- (d) The Advisory Staff may postpone the enforcement hearing date for good cause provided the Respondent is notified at least forty-eight (48) hours prior to the original enforcement hearing date and receives notice of the new hearing date as required in subparagraph (b) above. Good cause includes, but is not limited to impossibility of the parties' attendance or significant new information that may change the recommended decision and order.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5, Public Resources Code. Reference: Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code; Section 11125, Government Code.

§ 3007. Ex Parte Communication

- (a) There shall be no communication, direct or indirect, regarding any issue in the proceeding, with the Commissioners, their alternates, the Commissioners' personal staff, or the Advisory Staff from a party or an interested person, without notice and opportunity for all parties to participate in the communication. For the purposes of this section:
 - (1) The Commissioners' personal staff refers to the staff of: the Office of the Lieutenant Governor, the California State Controller's Office, and the Department of Finance, and excludes the staff of the California State Lands Commission.
 - (2) A party includes the Respondent, their agents or representatives, and the Enforcement Staff.
- (b) Communication between Commission staff and the Commissioners or their alternates shall comply with Government Code sections 11430.10 et seq.
- (c) Communications in violation of this section shall be remedied according to Government Code sections 11430.40 and 11430.50.
- (d) Communications between the Respondent and Commission enforcement staff concerning the pending enforcement matter are not prohibited.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5, Public Resources Code. Reference: Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code; Sections 11430.10 et seq. Government Code.

§ 3008. Conduct of Persons at Hearings

- (a) The following conduct is prohibited during or near the place of an enforcement hearing:
 - (1) Refusing to take an oath or affirmation as a witness or thereafter refusing to be examined;
or
 - (2) disorderly or boisterous conduct; or
 - (3) obstructing or interrupting the proceeding or interfering with the participants.
- (b) The Presiding Officer may exclude any persons from the hearing or premises for a violation of this section. If the person violating this section is a witness, the Presiding Officer may exclude further testimony by such person. If the person violating this section is the Respondent, the Respondent may be excluded and denied any further opportunity to present evidence.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5 Public Resources Code. Reference: Section 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code.

§ 3009. Procedure for Contested Matters

- (a) In the event that a Respondent responds within the 21 Day period specified in section 3004(b) above, the initial hearing date will be vacated and the following procedures apply.
- (b) The Enforcement Staff shall prepare a statement of position and Mail a copy to the Respondent and the Advisory Staff. The statement of position will set forth the evidence and argument suggesting the Respondent has violated section 6224.3 of the Public Resources Code. The Enforcement Staff's statement of position shall be Mailed to the Respondent at least thirty (30) Days after service of the Notice of Violation. Except evidence submitted with its response, all evidence and argument the Enforcement Staff wishes the Commission to consider must be submitted with the Enforcement Staff's statement of position.
- (c) The Respondent shall complete the Statement of Defense form and provide any other documents, evidence, or arguments the Respondent wishes the Commission to consider within forty-five (45) Days of the Enforcement Staff Mailing its statement of position. The Enforcement Staff's statement of position will notify the Respondent of this deadline.
- (d) The Enforcement Staff may prepare a response to the Respondent's Statement of Defense or other evidence and arguments. The Enforcement Staff's response shall be Mailed to the Advisory Staff and Respondent at least forty-five (45) Days prior to the enforcement hearing date.
- (e) It is the policy of the Commission to avoid surprise testimony and exhibits. The Enforcement Staff and Respondent must each submit in advance of the hearing all evidence the party would like the Commission to consider. The Presiding Officer shall exclude material not submitted in accordance with these regulations unless there is a showing of good cause and lack of prejudice to the parties. Excluded material will not be considered by the Commission.
- (f) On or before the deadlines specified above, the Enforcement Staff and Respondent shall submit:
 - (1) All evidence the party would like the Commission to consider. Evidence already in the Commission's files may be submitted by reference as long as the location of the evidence in the Commission's files is clearly identified.
 - (2) All legal and technical arguments or analysis.
 - (3) The name of each witness (including Commission staff) whom the party intends to call at the hearing, the subject(s) that will be covered by each witness, and the estimated time required by each witness to present their testimony. Witness testimony at the hearing may not exceed the scope of previously-submitted written material.
 - (4) The qualifications of each expert witness, if any.
 - (5) The Enforcement Staff may submit evidence of any type stated above with the Enforcement Staff's response if such evidence responds to arguments or evidence raised in the Respondent's arguments or evidence.
- (g) The Advisory Staff shall review the timely submitted evidence and argument and prepare a recommended decision and order. The recommended decision and order shall be in writing and shall include:
 - (1) a copy of the timely submitted arguments and evidence;

- (2) a brief summary of (A) any background to the alleged violation, (B) the allegations made by the Enforcement Staff, (C) a list of all allegations either admitted or not contested by the Respondent, (D) any timely submitted defenses and mitigating factors asserted by Respondent, and (E) any argument or evidence in rebuttal to matters raised by the Respondent;
- (3) a summary and analysis of all unresolved issues;
- (4) a recommended finding of fact;
- (5) the amount of any recommended civil penalty, along with any subsequent increase in the amount;
- (6) the name of the Respondent required to pay the civil penalty;
- (7) the date on which the civil penalty begins;
- (8) the recommended text of any Commission orders appropriate under the circumstances, including an injunction to cease and desist conduct, an order to surrender possession of State Land, an order to remove Structures, or an order to restore State Lands.
- (9) The date and location of the Commission meeting whereat the Respondent may appear and be heard. If logistical circumstances prevent specifying the precise starting time and/or address of the Commission Meeting, the recommended decision may state the date and city or general location provided the Respondent is notified at least ten (10) Days prior to the hearing of the precise location and start time.
- (h) At least thirty (30) Days prior to the enforcement hearing, the Advisory shall Mail the recommended enforcement order to the Respondent, the Presiding Officer, and other members of the Commission.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5 Public Resources Code. Reference: Section 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code.

§ 3010. Admissibility of Evidence

- (a) Enforcement hearings will be conducted in accordance with the provisions and rules of evidence set forth in Government Code section 11513. Hearsay evidence is admissible subject to the provisions of Government Code section 11513.
- (b) The Presiding Officer may exclude unduly repetitious or irrelevant evidence.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5, Public Resources Code. Reference: Section 11513, Government Code; Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code.

§ 3011. Failure of Respondent or Witness to Appear at Enforcement Hearing

- (a) Failure of a Respondent or witness to attend the properly noticed enforcement hearing constitutes a waiver of the opportunity to be heard at such hearing.
- (b) If the Respondent fails to appear after being served, the Commission may issue a decision and order, and the Commission may impose a fine.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5 Public Resources Code. Reference: Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, 6224.5, Public Resources Code; Section 11415.40, Government Code.

§ 3012. Enforcement Hearing Procedure

Enforcement hearings shall proceed in the following manner:

- (a) The Commission Chairperson or acting Chairperson shall serve as the Presiding Officer. The Presiding Officer shall announce the matter and ask all Respondents and/or their authorized agents present to identify themselves for the record.
- (b) The Presiding Officer may impose time limits for presentations by the Enforcement Staff, the Respondent, and the public at the hearing. The Presiding Officer may administer oaths to all witnesses.
- (c) The Enforcement Staff shall summarize the law, facts, and evidence supporting staff's position. The Enforcement Staff may present their position on the recommended enforcement order.
- (d) Each Respondent shall summarize its positions on the matters relevant to the alleged violation or recommended decision and order with particular attention matters in dispute.
- (e) The Presiding Officer and Commissioners may ask questions at any time during the hearing or deliberations.
- (f) The Commission may continue an enforcement hearing if, circumstances or fairness so dictate, which may include, but is not limited to, impossibility for the parties to attend, ongoing negotiations with a high probability of resolving the violation, or evidence is admitted under section 3009(e) above which requires further analysis or affects the recommended decision and order.
- (g) The Presiding Officer shall close the public hearing after the Enforcement Staff, the Respondent, and any additional speakers have completed their presentations.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5, Public Resources Code. Reference: Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code.

§ 3013. Written Decision and Order

- (a) After the enforcement hearing has concluded, the Commission shall render a decision as to whether or not the Respondent is liable for a violation of Section 6224.3 of the Public Resources Code, the appropriate penalty, and any further orders appropriate under the circumstances.
- (b) The Commission may:
 - (1) Adopt the recommended decision and order;
 - (2) Modify the recommended decision and order; or
 - (3) Direct the Advisory Staff to draft a decision and order on terms dictated by the Commission.

- (c) Once adopted by vote, the Commission's decision is final. The Commission ~~may~~ shall adopt a decision by majority vote, pursuant to the Commission's usual voting procedures. The decision and final order shall include notice that the Respondent may file a petition for writ of mandate with the superior court for review of the order pursuant to section 1094.5 of the Code of Civil Procedure within sixty (60) Days after the decision has become final.
- (d) The Respondent shall be provided a copy of the decision and order. The decision and order may be provided to the Respondent in person at the conclusion of the hearing or by Mail.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5, Public Resources Code. Reference: Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code; Section 11425.50, Government Code.

§ 3014. Penalty

- (a) The civil penalty imposed will be based on the per diem method of 6224.3(b) rather than the formula based on the market rate rental of the property unless the maximum penalty of \$1,000 a Day would represent a discount in rent. If the market rate rental of the property exceeds \$365,000 annually, the Commission may impose a monthly penalty of up to 13.33% of the annual rent, which represents one twelfth (1/12) of one hundred sixty percent (160%) of the normal rent, rounded down.
- (b) For properties where the market rental rate is below \$365,000 annually, the fine imposed shall be:
 - (1) Five hundred dollars (\$500) per Day for the first one hundred twenty (120) Days.
 - (2) One thousand dollars (\$1,000) per Day starting on the one hundred twenty-first (121st) Day.
- (c) The Commission shall consider the factors specified in Section 6224.3(c) of the Public Resources Code before imposing the penalties specified above, and may modify the penalties based on such factors.
- (d) A penalty under this Article shall be imposed from the first Day after the decision becomes final as defined in regulation 3013, subdivision (c) and shall continue until the violation is remedied.
- (e) The Commission may modify the penalty to a reduced amount for a set period of time. In deciding whether to set a reduced penalty, and the length of time the penalty is reduced, the Commission shall consider relevant factors, including but not limited to:
 - (1) The Respondent's diligence in remedying the violation.
 - (2) Staff processing time for an application.
 - (3) Other permits or approvals necessary to remedy the violation.
- (f) If a penalty is reduced under subsection (e) above, the Respondent must work diligently to remedy the violation.
- (g) A penalty under this Article shall terminate when:
 - (1) the Structure(s) specified in the decision and order are removed from State Lands, and all remnants or debris therefrom have been removed; or

- (2) the Respondent obtains Commission Authorization for all Structures specified in the decision and order.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5, Public Resources Code. Reference: Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code.

§ 3015. Enforcement Record

The record of an enforcement hearing shall consist of the following unless they do not exist:

- (a) the Notice of Violation and the Enforcement Staff's statement of position including all documents referred to in the documents;
- (b) the Advisory Staff's recommended decision and order, including all documents referred to therein;
- (c) the Respondent's Statement of Defense form and other timely submitted evidence and argument;
- (d) Evidence and argument submitted by the Respondent but excluded from the record, along with the reasons why such evidence was excluded;
- (e) minutes of all Commission enforcement hearings on the matter or a transcript of the proceedings;
- (f) evidence submitted by the Respondent, or presented by Commission staff at the enforcement hearing if admitted by the Presiding Officer and not already included above;
- (g) the final decision and order approved by the Commission;
- (h) any statutes, regulations, or other legal authorities or precedents relied on by the Commission or the Respondent; and
- (i) any other information or documents considered or relied on by the Commission in the matter.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5 Public Resources Code. Reference: Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code.

§ 3016. Precedent Decisions.

The Commission may designate a decision or part of a decision that contains a significant legal or policy determination of general application that is likely to recur as a precedent decision.

NOTE: Authority Cited: Sections 6108 and 6224.5 Public Resources Code. Reference: Sections 6224.3, 6224.4, and 6224.5, Public Resources Code; Section 11425.60, Government Code.

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

The California State Lands Commission will hold an enforcement hearing to determine whether to impose administrative civil penalties and whether to issue an order for removal of structures

against

[Respondent's Name]

[general description of location and structures]

The enforcement hearing has been scheduled before the California State Lands Commission on:

[Date] at [City]

If you dispute the allegations, you must respond to this notice by [date]. The hearing date above will be postponed and you will be given an opportunity to present evidence in your defense.

If you do not respond to this notice, the California State Lands Commission may issue a civil penalty and/or order to remove structures from state land without your having an opportunity to contest the charges or to introduce evidence in your defense.

To minimize or avoid future penalties you should immediately contact the staff identified below to bring your structures into compliance.

Purpose of Hearing

The California State Lands Commission (Commission) is issuing this Notice of Violation (Notice), along with the enclosed Statement of Defense form because Commission Enforcement Staff believes you may be responsible for maintaining a structure on land owned by the state and under Commission jurisdiction without appropriate Commission authorization in violation of California Public Resources Code (PRC) § 6224.3.

At the enforcement hearing, the Commission will consider the evidence and determine: 1) whether you are liable for maintaining unauthorized structures on state land; 2) whether a civil penalty and/or order for removal is appropriate; and 3) the amount and conditions of the civil penalty.

Civil Penalty

The Commission may impose a civil penalty of up to one thousand dollars (\$1,000.00) per day, or 160% of the market rent where the rental value of the property would exceed \$365,000 per year, while the violation continues. (Public Resources Code, § 6224.3(b)). The

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

Commission may also issue an injunction against your continued unauthorized occupation of state land or order the removal of the violating structures. **The Commission may rule on the evidence before it and impose a civil penalty and order even if you fail to respond to this Notice or appear at the enforcement hearing.** You may reduce penalties by promptly removing any unauthorized structures from state land and submitting proof of restoring state land to Commission staff, or by bringing all structures under lease. The Commission reserves discretion whether to authorize any proposed use of state land.

Hearing Process

The enforcement hearing is an informal administrative hearing before the Commission. The Commissioners are the Lieutenant Governor, the State Controller, and the Director of the Department of Finance. The Commissioners or their designated alternates preside over the hearings as the hearing officers. A copy of the regulations governing Commission enforcement hearings is included with this Notice for your reference.

If you do not respond to this Notice by the deadline specified above, the scheduled meeting will proceed. If the exact address and start time of the enforcement hearing is not specified above, you will be notified at least ten (10) days prior to the meeting. The Commission Enforcement Staff will present its case to the Commissioners. If the Commissioners find the evidence supports a ruling against you, the Commissioners may adopt a ruling, impose a penalty, and issue an order against you. You will be provided with a written copy of the decision.

You may resolve this matter informally without the need for a hearing and the associated penalties. If you respond to the contact person identified below before the deadline and state that you wish to resolve the matter, Commission staff may be able to postpone or dismiss this entire action. If you act promptly to either bring the structure under lease or remove it, you will minimize any potential fines and may have the entire proceeding dismissed. You are encouraged to discuss your options with Commission staff.

If you dispute the allegations, contact the Commission Enforcement Staff identified below before [date]. The hearing date above will be postponed so that you can submit information in your defense. The Commission Enforcement Staff will prepare a statement of position which is a more detailed analysis of the information enclosed with this Notice. You will receive the statement of position between 30 and 180 days of receiving this Notice.

You have forty-five (45) days to respond from the date the Enforcement Staff mails its Statement of Position. The statement of position will specify the exact deadline. You may submit any evidence or argument that disproves the allegations, relates to whether you are liable for maintaining unauthorized structures on state land, or might reduce the penalties associated therewith. The enclosed Statement of Defense form is designed to help you focus your evidence and arguments toward the relevant issues. You may use a separate paper and enclose any other evidence, but you are strongly advised to respond to each section in the Statement of Defense

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

form. The summary of allegations in this Notice is designed to help you begin preparing your defense. **You must submit all evidence and argument in your defense by the date your Statement of Defense is due. Evidence submitted after the deadline may be excluded from consideration.**

The Commission Enforcement Staff may prepare a response to your submitted argument and evidence. This response document is optional. If the Enforcement Staff prepares a response, the response may include new information or evidence limited in scope to responding to your arguments and evidence. Otherwise, the Enforcement Staff is limited to evidence presented with its statement of position. The Enforcement Staff must submit their response at least forty-five (45) days before the enforcement hearing. You will be provided with this document if it produced.

At least thirty (30) days prior to the enforcement hearing, the Advisory Staff will prepare a proposed decision and order. This document will summarize and analyze the argument and evidence submitted by both sides. The proposed decision and order functions like a tentative ruling in a court case by making proposed findings of fact and recommending a specific penalty and any associated orders. This document will also specify the date and location of your hearing.

Your hearing will occur at a regularly scheduled public Commission meeting. Although the date and general city of the Commission's meetings are available in advance, the Commission's meetings can vary greatly in length and the number of persons attending. Accordingly, the specific venue and start time may be adjusted. If the exact address and start time of the Commission's meeting is not specified in the recommended decision and order, you will be notified at least ten (10) days prior to the meeting. You should be prepared for a 9:00 a.m. start time, and set aside the entire day for the hearing. The Commission may address other business before your enforcement hearing, so you should be prepared to wait until your matter is called.

At the hearing, each side will be limited to presenting the argument and evidence already submitted. Your presentation should focus on the law or facts in controversy. Once each side has concluded their presentations, the Commissioners may ask questions and issue a ruling. The ruling may adopt or modify the proposed decision and order. Once the Commission issues a decision and votes to adopt it, the ruling is final. You may appeal this decision to a civil court of competent jurisdiction within sixty (60) days pursuant to Public Resources Code section 6224(e).

Obtaining Documents and Evidence

The evidence this Notice refers to is available at the Commission's Sacramento office. You can arrange to review these materials at the Commission's Sacramento office, have copies made at your expense, or both by contacting then Enforcement Staff specified below. Documents shall be provided within five (5) days of your request and upon paying all copying

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

costs. Alternately, you may enquire whether the documents are available electronically, including the location on the Commission's website.

Any documents served after this Notice will be delivered by U.S. mail or similar commercial carrier to the location where your property tax bill is sent unless you specify otherwise. When you respond to this Notice, you may specify the mailing address and/or provide information for electronic delivery of documents via electronic mail or other means. You are strongly encouraged to provide an electronic mail address as this avoids postal delays and ensures you have more time to respond to the allegations.

Separation of Function

The Commissioners serve as the decision makers in this matter. The Advisory Staff assists the Commissioners and is composed of the Executive Officer and his or her designees. The Enforcement Staff represents Commission staff before the Commission and is composed of the Chief of the Commission's Land Management Division and his or designees.

In order to maintain separation of functions, the Enforcement Staff and the Respondent (you) are prohibited from communicating with the Commission, the Commissioner's alternates, or the Advisory Staff regarding any substantive matter in this proceeding. See section 3007 of the enclosed regulations for more information.

Contact Information

Enforcement Staff

Name _____

Address _____

Phone Number _____

Email _____

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

Nature of the Violation

1. Person or persons believed responsible for violation:

2. Location of State Land and basis for Commission Jurisdiction over the land in question:

3. Basis for determining the boundary of State Land:

4. Description of specific structure(s) in violation:

5. Duration of the violation (if pertinent and known):

6. Dates of previous attempts by Commission staff to contact persons believed to be responsible for violation (if pertinent and known):

NOTICE OF VIOLATION

-
-
7. Summary of pertinent information and documentation currently known to Commission staff with reference to supporting evidence contained in the enforcement file. (You may contact the Commission staff member listed above to arrange review of the file maintained at the Commission's Sacramento office):

8. If Commission staff is proposing a modification to the penalty described in Title 2, California Code of Regulations, Section 3014 based on the factors described in Public Resources Code § 6224.3(c), then the facts cited and factors relied on are:

9. Any other statement or information that Commission staff believes is either pertinent to the alleged violation or important to a full understanding of the alleged violation:

STATEMENT OF DEFENSE

ADMINISTRATIVE OR LEGAL ENFORCEMENT PROCEEDINGS MAY BE INITIATED AGAINST YOU. IF THAT OCCURS, YOUR STATEMENTS TO COMMISSION STAFF AND YOUR RESPONSES ON THIS FORM WILL BECOME PART OF THE ENFORCEMENT RECORD AND MAY BE USED AGAINST YOU. YOU MAY WISH TO CONSULT WITH OR RETAIN AN ATTORNEY BEFORE YOU COMPLETE THIS FORM OR OTHERWISE CONTACT COMMISSION STAFF.

This form is enclosed with a Notice of Violation (Notice). The Notice indicates that you may be liable for an unauthorized structure or structures on state-owned land under Commission jurisdiction. The Notice summarizes the alleged offense, the evidence supporting the allegation, and other pertinent information concerning the possible violation.

If you have responded by the deadline on the enclosed Notice and wish to dispute the allegations, you should complete this form. **This form, along with any evidence you wish the Commission to consider, is due forty-five (45) days after the Enforcement Staff mails its statement of position.** The statement of position will specify the applicable deadline. You must submit any response to the alleged facts contained in the Notice, raise any defenses that you believe apply, request any cross-examination that you believe necessary, and inform Commission staff of all facts that you believe may exonerate you of any legal responsibility for the possible violation or may mitigate any civil penalties imposed on or before the deadline provided on the statement of position. **Evidence not timely submitted may not be considered by the Commission.**

The completed Statement of Defense form requires you to enclose copies of all written documents (such as letters, photographs, maps, drawings, etc.) and written declarations under penalty of perjury that you want the Commission to consider as part of the enforcement hearing.

If you want to cross-examine any person on whose testimony Commission staff has relied in the violation report, you must complete paragraph seven (7) of this Statement of Defense form. This paragraph requires you to set out: (1) the name(s) of the person(s) you want to cross-examine, (2) the area of knowledge about which you want to cross-examine the person(s), including a specific reference to the fact or information you dispute, (3) references to any documents about which you want to cross-examine the person(s), (4) the information that you believe can be elicited by cross-examination, and (5) the reason why you believe this information cannot be presented by declaration or other document.

Instructions: In order to decide whether you are liable for a violation of Public Resources Code 6224.3, the Commission will consider: (1) whether the structure in question is on state-owned land under Commission jurisdiction; (2) whether you installed, maintain, or use the structure in question; (3) whether you have authorization from the Commission for the structure in question; and (4) whether an exemption applies. The most effective defense will address these four

STATEMENT OF DEFENSE

elements. Use the paragraphs below to organize your responses. You may use additional paper, but please number the responses according to the paragraphs below.

If you have any questions, please contact as soon as possible _____ of the Commission Enforcement Staff at telephone number (916) 574-1900. Return the completed form with any additional pages to:

California State Lands Commission
Attn: Enforcement Staff
100 Howe Avenue, Suite 100-South
Sacramento, CA 95825-8202

1. Facts or allegations contained in the Notice of Violation that you admit with specific reference to the paragraph number in the Notice of Violation.

2. Facts or allegations contained in the Notice of Violation that you deny with specific reference to paragraph number in the Notice of Violation.

3. Facts or allegations contained in the Notice of Violation of which you have no personal knowledge with specific reference to the paragraph number in the Notice of Violation.

STATEMENT OF DEFENSE

4. Other facts which may exonerate or mitigate your possible responsibility or otherwise explain your relationship to the possible violation. Be as specific as you can. If you know of any documents, photographs, maps, letters, or other evidence that you believe are relevant, please identify it by name, date, type, and any other identifying information and provide the original or a copy if you can.

5. Any other information, statement, etc. that you want to make.

6. Documents, exhibits, declarations under penalty of perjury or other materials that you have attached to this statement to support your answers or that you want to be made part of the administrative record for this enforcement proceeding. Please list in chronological order by date, author, and title and enclose a copy with this completed form.

7. The name of any person(s) whose declaration under penalty of perjury was listed in the Notice of Violation as being part of Commission staff's evidence who you want to cross-examine, all documents about which you want to cross-examine the person(s), a description of the area of knowledge about which you want to cross-examine the person(s) including specific reference to the facts or information you dispute, the information that the you hope to elicit in cross-examination, and the reason(s) why some other method of providing this information is unsatisfactory.
